

**Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine
Yaroslav Mudryi National Law University**

Department of Law of the European Union

**WORK PROGRAMME OF ACADEMIC DISCIPLINE
"JUDICIAL PROTECTION IN THE EUROPEAN UNION"**

Level of higher education – Second (Master's) level

Degree of higher education – Master's degree

Field of knowledge – 29 "International relations"

Speciality – 293 "International Law"

Discipline status – the student's discretion

Recruitment year– 2022

Kharkiv 2022

Work programme of academic discipline "Judicial protection in the European Union" for students of higher education of the second (Master's) level of higher education in the field of knowledge 29 "International relations" of the speciality 293 "International law". Kharkiv : Yaroslav Mudryi National Law University, 2022. 28 p.

Developer:
Tetyana Komarova,
Doctor of Law, Professor

Approved at the meeting of the EU Law Department
(minutes No.1 dated "01" September 2022)

The head of the department – Yakovyuk Ivan Vasyliovych, doctor of legal sciences, professor, professor

The updated version (with changes and additions) was approved at a meeting of the Department of Law of the European Union (minutes No 12 of 22 June 2023)

The head of the department – Komarova Tatyana Vyacheslavovna, doctor of legal sciences, professor, professor

Contents

1. Description of the discipline	4
2. Expected learning outcomes.....	6
3. Programme of the discipline.....	10
4. The scope and structure of the discipline.....	13
4.1. For full-time higher education students.....	13
4.2. For part-time higher education students	15
5. Forms of pedagogical control and means of assessment of learning outcomes..	16
6. Criteria for assessing learning outcomes.....	18
7. Pedagogical control for students of full-time/part-time higher education.....	19
8. Educational, methodological and information support of the discipline.....	19

1. Description of the discipline

The curriculum of the discipline "Judicial protection in the European Union" was developed in accordance with the educational and professional program "International Law" of the second (Master's) level of higher education, field of knowledge 29 "International Relations", specialty 293 "International Law".

Indicators	Field of knowledge, speciality, level of education	Didactic structure of the discipline	
		full-time education	full-time education
Number of ECTS credits - 4.0	Field of knowledge - 29 "International law"	At the student's discretion	At the student's discretion
Number of modules - 3		Year of preparation: 2022-2023	Year of preparation: 2022-2023
	Speciality - 293 "International Law"	Semester	Semester
Total number of hours - 120		1-3	1-3
Weekly hours for full-time education: Classroom studies - 2-4, independent work of the student - 6 - 8.	Level of education – second (master's) degree	Lectures	Lectures
		18 hours	6 hours
		Practical/seminar classes	Practical/seminar classes
		20 hours	4 hours
		Independent work	Independent work
		82 hours	110 hours
		Types of control: Ongoing monitoring; final control of knowledge (credit test)	Types of control: Ongoing monitoring; final control of knowledge (credit test)

The aim of the discipline is to develop theoretical, practical and scientific knowledge in the field of judicial protection in the EU, the principles of its provision and guarantees, the functioning and implementation of the jurisdictions granted to the Court of Justice of the EU, the formation of professional ideas about the mechanisms for protecting the rights of individuals within the Union, deepening the legal outlook of students, as well as in the development of skills to correctly apply the EU law in future professional activities.

Tasks of the discipline are:

- mastering by students of the necessary theoretical provisions developed by the science of EU law, which reveal the essence and features of judicial protection in the EU;

- mastering the normative material that is the result of the law-making activity of EU institutions and bodies, the practice of the EU judicial system, as well as those rules of conduct that are formed in the process of cooperation between the EU, its member states and other subjects of international law;

- getting acquainted with the process of formation and functioning of all parts of the European Union judicial system;

- to get acquainted with the latest practice of the EU judicial system, as well as the development of students' skills to independently analyze and evaluate it, in particular through theoretical generalization of practical experience;

- identification of applied problems arising as a result of the protection of the rights of private individuals in the EU judicial system, identification of ways to optimize these mechanisms;

- formation of skills to protect the rights of national law subjects subject to EU law;

- familiarize students to the methodology of obtaining information on various aspects of the judicial system of the European Union, including with through bibliography and modern technical means (electronic databases and the Internet).

The tasks of the discipline include teaching students to prepare court speeches and participate in court debates.

Prerequisites: European Union law and its system.

Requirements: Legal regulation of the EU internal market, EU corporate law and governance, European Union competition (anti-monopoly) law, Protection of rights in the European Court of Human Rights, EU migration law.

2. Expected learning outcomes

As a result of mastering the discipline, the higher education student must demonstrate the following learning outcomes:

LO 1. Demonstrate knowledge of key concepts, principles, theories and doctrines of European Union judicial law

LO 2. Demonstrate knowledge of the specifics of the EU legal system, its sources and features of their formation and application, and their place in this hierarchy of EU judicial practice.

LO 3. Demonstrate knowledge of the laws of the evolution of the EU judicial system, its stages and the evolution of the jurisdiction of the EU judicial system.

LO 4. Search for, independently study and analyze domestic and foreign international legal literature in the context of researching current problems of the judicial system and judicial protection in the European Union.

LO 5. To characterize the evolution and current state of subjects that are subject to protection in the courts of the European Union.

LO 6. Identify the problems of access of Ukrainian subjects of law to judicial protection in the European Union.

LO 7. Analyze main approaches to determining the nature and place of the judicial law of the European Union in the process of forming mechanisms for the protection of human rights, to be able to compare these mechanisms with other international mechanisms and national means of protection.

LO 8. Identify problems that arise in the process of applying judicial protection mechanisms at the level of the European Union and EU member states, propose ways to overcome them in accordance with the principles of EU law, fundamental principles of international law, general principles of law, the practice of international organizations and modern doctrinal developments on the relevant issue.

LO 9. Describe the current state of development of the judicial system of the European Union, formulate own proposals for improving the relevant mechanisms of judicial protection of various legal entities.

LO 10. To carry out a logical, critical and systematic analysis of normative legal acts of the European Union and decisions of the courts of the European Union.

LO 11. Characterize the stages of development of mechanisms for the protection of the rights of individuals in the courts of the European Union.

LO 12. Identify the nature of judgements and ruling of EU courts.

LO 13. Demonstrate knowledge of case law related to the protection of the rights of Ukrainian individuals in the European Union.

The teaching of the discipline ensures the formation of general and special competencies and the achievement of learning outcomes determined by the higher education standards of the relevant specialty and the educational and professional program "International Law", namely:

General competencies :

GC 1. Ability to critical thinking, analysis and synthesis.

GC 2. The ability to identify and solve problems arising in the professional sphere, to formulate and ask questions for their further solution.

GC 6. Ability to work effectively in an intercultural environment, in particular to develop and manage international projects.

GC 7. Ability to conduct research at the appropriate level.

GC 10. Ability to work (collect, receive, systematize and synthesize) with a variety of information and large amounts of information from various sources, analyze and critically and constructively evaluate it, taking into account the cross-cultural characteristics of subjects of international relations.

GC 11. Ability to use the latest information and communication technologies for professional purposes.

GC 15. Ability to understand the specifics of the subject area and professional activity, to make informed, balanced decisions and to be aware of their ethical consequences.

GC 16. Ability to communicate with representatives of other professional groups of different levels, from other fields of knowledge and activities, as well as the ability to work in an international professional environment.

Special competencies:

SC 3. Ability to independently provide legal representation of the interests of individuals, legal entities or the state when considering cases in national and international institutions and organize the provision of legal services.

SC 4. Ability to comprehensively use highly specialized knowledge in specific areas of regulation of international public law, international private law, and European law to solve applied problems.

SC 7. Ability to represent the interests of Ukraine or individuals and legal entities in international judicial institutions, arbitrations, national courts of foreign countries.

SC 12. Ability to conduct research and/or introduce innovations in various fields and institutions of international public law, international private law, EU law.

SC 14. Ability to apply an interdisciplinary approach in the assessment of international legal phenomena and international relations using legal instruments.

SC 15. Ability to make decisions in situations requiring a systematic, logical and functional interpretation of the norms of international law (public/private), the European Union law, as well as an understanding of the peculiarities of the practice of their application.

SC 16. Ability to work with international documentation (treaties, acts of international organizations and bodies, etc.), determine their legal nature, draft projects and accompanying documentation in Ukrainian and foreign languages.

SC 20. Ability to provide a proper legal assessment of evidence in a legal case and in a specific procedural situation, the ability to work with evidence, to solve the problems of planning and organizing the legal process, to solve a legal case within different jurisdictions.

SC 21. The ability to communicate effectively in an international, multicultural environment using knowledge in the fields of international law, European law and international relations.

Program learning outcomes:

PLO 1. Analyze multifaceted problems of international and national legal content

and propose ways to solve them.

PLO 5. Provide legal representation of the client in national courts, international commercial arbitrations, state authorities and local governments.

PLO 6. Protect the interests of one's own state in national courts, international commercial arbitrations, international courts and organizations, in particular integration ones, at international conferences.

PLO 7. Make informed decisions based on the acquired knowledge of international public, private and EU law and to be aware of their consequences for various subjects of national and international law.

PLO 9. To be aware of the mechanism and consequences of the implementation of the norms of international treaties, the application of acts of international intergovernmental organizations, the implementation of decisions of international courts in the national legal order.

PLO 16. Determine the content and legal nature of national normative legal acts, international treaties and other international documents, identify conflicts between the norms of international treaties, between the norms of an international treaty and acts of national legislation, and also propose ways to resolve them.

PLO 17. Conduct research on international legal issues, using primary sources and methods of legal interpretation of complex problems arising from this research, to argue the conclusions and present the research results.

PLO 18. Freely use available information and communication technologies and databases for professional activities.

PTO 20. To demonstrate the ability to conduct legal business, the skills of complex legal and economic analysis of a commercial project, including an international one, taking risks into account.

3. Programme of the discipline

Module 1. Organizational structure of the European Union judicial system.

The history of the formation of the judicial system of the European Union. Robert Schuman's Declaration of 1950 (the "Monet-Schuman" method). The establishment of the European Coal and Steel Community in 1951, proposed models for the future judiciary and the establishment of the Court of Justice of the European Coal and Steel Community. Jurisdiction of the Court of Justice of the European Coal and Steel Community. Establishment of the European Economic Community and the European Atomic Energy Community under the Treaties of Rome in 1957. Extension of the jurisdiction of the Court of the European Communities. The establishment of the European Union in 1992 and the impact of the reform on the Court of the European Communities. Reform of the Court of the European Communities according to the Amsterdam 1997 and Nice Treaties 2000. Draft Constitution for Europe 2004. Lisbon Treaty 2007 as a new stage in the development of European integration and reform of the EU judicial system. Judicial reform of 2017. The EU judicial system in the institutional system of the Union.

The structure of the EU judicial system at the present stage. Principles of the EU judicial system. General characteristics of the EU judicial system: the Court of Justice and the General Court. The procedure for the formation of judicial system. Internal structure of judicial system. Legal status of judges and Advocates General in the EU judicial system. The system of jurisdiction of the Court of Justice and procedural forms of its implementation. The system of jurisdiction of the General Court.

Module 2. Major proceedings in the Court of Justice of the EU.

Proceedings to ensure enforcement of obligations under EU law. Grounds of proceedings. Subjects of the proceedings. Stages of the proceedings: administrative and judicial stages. Phases of the administrative stage: Commission's investigation, issuance of a formal summons and issuance of a reasoned opinion. The effect of the decisions of the Court of Justice of the EU in these proceedings. Imposition of sanctions: fines and/or penalties. Enforcement of judgements.

Proceedings for the repeal of illegitimate EU regulations. Object of appeal. Grounds for recognizing the act as invalid: lack of competence of the institution, body or institution to adopt the act, significant procedural violations in the adoption of the act, violation of the provisions of founding agreements or other legal norms relating to their application, or abuse of power. Claimants: privileged, semi-privileged, non-privileged. *Locus standi* proof by non-privileged plaintiffs (private individuals): the existence of a direct and individual impact of the act on a private individual. Practice with a Ukrainian element.

Preliminary proceedings on the examination of cases at the request of the national courts of the Member States. The subject matter of preliminary proceedings. The concept of "national court or tribunal". The right/obligation to apply with a preliminary request. Form of preliminary request.

Other proceedings in the Court of Justice of the EU. The procedure for challenging the illegitimate inaction of the EU institutions, the procedure for claims for extra-contractual liability of the Union, the procedure for issuing conclusions on the compatibility of international agreements concluded by the Union and third countries or international organizations with the founding treaties, the procedure for issuing decisions in accordance with arbitration clauses, etc.

Module 3. The impact of the practice of the CJEU on the EU legal order.

Judgement of the Court of Justice of the EU: nature and functions. Appealing decisions of the General Court. The nature of decisions of the EU judicial system. Types of decisions issued by EU courts: decisions, orders, conclusions. The place of judgments in the hierarchy of sources of EU law. Issues related to the doctrine of *stare decisis* within the EU judicial system. Methods of interpretation used by EU judicial bodies in their activities. Interaction with other international judicial institutions: the European Court of Human Rights (in the context of EU's accession to the Convention on Fundamental Rights and Freedoms of 1950), the EFTA Court, etc. Cooperation with national judicial institutions of the EU member states and its role in the formation of the integration legal order.

The impact of the practice of the EU judicial system on EU institutions and law.

Development of the principle of institutional balance by the EU Court of Justice. Establishment of the principle of autonomy of the EU legal order by the case law of the Court of Justice of the EU. Establishment and development of the principle of direct effect of EU law. Establishment and development of the doctrine of liability of EU member states for breach of EU law. Protection of human rights by the EU judicial system. Establishment and development of the rule of law principle and recent trends (cases against Poland and Hungary).

Overview of the practice of the EU Court of Justice for the past year. General statistical review of the case law of the Court of Justice in 2022. Focus of the Court of Justice in certain areas of EU law in 2022. General statistical review of the case law of the General Court for 2022. Focus of the case law of the General Court in certain areas of EU law in 2022.

4. The scope and structure of the discipline

4.1. For students of full-time higher education

No	Date (according to the schedule)	Subjects of the training course	Volume in hours			
			Total amount	Including		
				Lectures	Practical classes, seminar classes, colloquiums, etc	Independent work
		Module 1. Organizational structure of the judicial system of the European Union				
		Topic 1. The history of the formation of the judicial system of the European Union.		2	2	8
		Topic 2 . The structure of the EU judicial system		2	2	8

		at the current stage.				
		<i>Total</i>		4	4	16
		Module 2. Main proceedings in the Court of Justice of the EU				
		Topic 3. Proceedings to ensure enforcement of obligations under EU law.		2	4	10
		Topic 4. Proceedings in cases of annulment of illegitimate EU regulatory acts.		2	2	10
		Topic 5. Pre-trial proceedings on the consideration of cases at the request of the national courts of the member states.		2	2	10
		Topic 6. Other proceedings in the EU Court of Justice.		2	2	10
		<i>Total</i>		8	10	40
		Module 3. The impact of the practice of the EU Court of Justice on the EU legal order				
		Topic 7. Decisions of the EU Court of Justice: nature and functions.		2	2	8
		Topic 8. The influence of the practice of the EU judicial system on EU institutions and law.		2	2	8

		Topic 9. Review of the practice of the EU Court of Justice for the past year.		2	2	10
		<i>Total</i>		6	6	26
		Total hours / ECTS credits	120/4.0	18	20	82

4.2. For applicants of higher education in correspondence form of education

No –	Date (according to the schedule)	Subjects of the training course	Volume in hours			
			Total	Including		
				Lectures	Practical classes, seminar classes, colloquiums, etc	Independent work
		Module 1. Organizational structure of the judicial system of the European Union				
		Topic 1. The history of the formation of the judicial system of the European Union.	-	-	-	12
		Topic 2 . The structure of the EU judicial system at the current stage.	-	2	-	12

		<i>Total</i>	26	2		24
		Module 2. Main proceedings in the Court of Justice of the EU				
		Topic 3. Proceedings to ensure enforcement of obligations under EU law.	-	-	2	12
		Topic 4. Proceedings in cases of annulment of illegitimate EU regulatory acts.	-	-	-	12
		Topic 5. Pre-trial proceedings on the consideration of cases at the request of the national courts of the member states.	-	2	-	12
		Topic 6. Other proceedings in the EU Court of Justice.	-	-	-	14
		<i>Total</i>	54	2	2	50
		Module 3. The impact of the practice of the EU Court of Justice on the EU legal order				
		Topic 7. Decisions of the EU Court of Justice: nature and functions.	-	-	-	12
		Topic 8. The influence of the practice of the EU judicial system on EU institutions and law.	-	2	-	12

		Topic 9. Review of the practice of the EU Court of Justice for the past year.	-	-	2	12
		<i>Total</i>	40	2	2	36
		Total hours / ECTS credits	120/4.0	6	4	110

5. Forms of pedagogical control and means of assessment of learning outcomes

Forms of students' knowledge control are ongoing monitoring and final control.

The task of ongoing monitoring is to check the understanding and assimilation of certain material, the ability to independently process texts, the ability to understand the content of a topic or section, the ability to publicly or in writing present certain material (presentation).

The objects of ongoing monitoring of students' knowledge are:

a) systematic and active work at lectures, practical classes (attending relevant forms of the educational process, activity and level of knowledge when discussing issues; participation in student conferences, circles, competitions, Olympiads; other forms of work);

b) performing test control works (test modules);

c) completion of tasks for independent processing (independent processing of topics in general or individual issues; writing abstracts, essays and their presentation; preparation of abstracts of educational or scientific texts; preparation of abstract materials from publications; other forms of work).

During the practical lesson, a student can receive a grade on a six-point scale (0, 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6);

The mandatory form of independent work of students is the preparation of an individual final written work. The maximum number of points based on the results of the defense of an individual final written work is 20 points.

The form of final control students' knowledge is a differentiated test. The minimum number of points to obtain a differentiated credit is 60 points.

Points distribution between the organizational forms of the educational process and types of control:

Ongoing monitoring							Final assessment of knowledge (differentiated credit)
Module No. 1		Module No. 2		Module No. 3		Independent work of students	
p/z	Testing	p/z	Testing	p/z	Testing		
max 12	maximum 6	max 24	max 10	maximum 18	max 10	max 20	max 100

6 . Criteria for learning outcomes evaluating

type of control	Points	Criteria (for each assessment)
Ongoing monitoring in a practical session	Max 6	Excellent mastering of educational material on the topic, some minor shortcomings are possible.
	4	Good mastering of the material on the topic, but some mistakes.
	3	Satisfactory level of mastering of the material, a significant number of errors
	2	The minimum level of mastering of the material, a significant number of errors.
	Min 0	Unsatisfactory level of mastering of the material.
Testing/quiz/colloquium	Mach 10/6	The results of processing the material are high, a small number of insignificant errors are possible.
	6/4	Satisfactory level of mastering of the material, a significant number of errors.
	Minimum 0	Unsatisfactory level of mastering of the material.
Assesment of the independent work of a student of higher education	Mach 20	Deep knowledge of the problems related to the research topic. Fluency in the material, the ability to think independently and creatively, find, generalize, analyze the material, draw independent theoretical and practical conclusions.

	15	The main issues are covered superficially, the conclusions do not have an independent character.
	Minimum 0	The main provisions of the topic are covered superficially, with a large number of errors, there are no conclusions, the student has a weak command of the work material.

7. Pedagogical control for full-time / correspondence students of higher education

Skills Rating Scale: National and ECTS

ECTS grade	Description	National scale grade	Estimation on a 100-point scale used at NYU
A	Excellent - Excellent performance, with only a few mistakes	Pass	90 - 100
B	Very good - average level of work with some mistakes		80-89
C	Good - correct work with minor mistakes		75-79
D	Satisfactory - not bad, but with many mistakes		70-74
E	Sufficient – the performance satisfies the minimum criteria		60-69
FX	Unsatisfactory – with the possibility of re-examination	Fail	35-59
F	Unsatisfactory – with compulsory re-study of subject		0 - 34

8. Educational, methodical and information support of the discipline

Basic literature:

1. European Union law: the basics of the theory: a textbook / edited by I. V. Yakovyuk. Kharkiv: Pravo, 2021. 360 p.
2. Law of the European Union: textbook / [R. A. Petrov (head of author's team), A. O. Vakulenko, Van Elsouwege P. and others]; under the editorship

- R. A. Petrova. Kind. 10th, amended and supplemented. Kharkiv: Pravo, 2021. 484 p.
3. Law of the European Union: regulation. materials / edited by: I. V. Yakovyuk, T. M. Anakina, T. V. Komarova, O. Y. Tragniuk; under the editorship I. V. Yakovyuk. - Kharkiv: Pravo, 2019. - 500 p.
 4. European Law: the Law of the European Union: textbook: in four books/ for general ed. V. I. Muravyov. K.: In Yure, 2015-2016.
 5. The history of European integration from the Roman Empire to the European Union: a monograph / ed. I. V. Yakovyuk. K., 2012. 208 p.
 6. State sovereignty in the context of European integration: monograph. / edited by Y. P. Bytyaka, I. V. Yakovyuk. K.: Law of Ukraine, 2012. 336 p.
 7. Kopyyka V. V. The European Union: history and principles of functioning: academic. help _ / V. V. Kopyyka, T. I. Shinkarenko; under the editorship V. I. Huberskyi. 2nd ed., corrected. and added K.: Znannia, 2012. 759 p.
 8. Cairns V. Introduction to the law of the European Union: Education. help _ / Trans. from English K.: Znannia, 2002. 381 p.
 9. Komarova T. V. Jurisdiction of the Court of the European Union: monograph Kh.: Pravo, 2010. 360 p.
 10. Komarova T.V. Court of the European Union: development of the judicial system and practice of interpretation of EU law: monograph. Kharkiv: Pravo, 2018. 528 p.
 11. Kopyyka V.V., The European Union at the present stage: structural changes and development strategy: scientific edition / V. V. Kopyyka, T. I. Shinkarenko, M. A. Myronova. K.: Znannia, 2010. 94 p.
 12. Kordon M.V. European and Euro-Atlantic integration of Ukraine / Education. Manual. K.: TsUL, 2008. 172 p.
 13. Mykievich M. M. Institutional law of the European Union in the sphere of foreign policy and security: Monograph. Lviv: LNU Publishing Center named after Ivan Franko, 2005. 416 p.

14. Petrov R. A. Transposition of the European "acquis ". Union in legal systems the third country: monograph. K : Ishtina , 2011. 384 p.
15. Deepening of relations between the EU and Ukraine: what, why and how? / Under the editorship M. Emerson and V. Movchan. Brussels: CEPS, Kyiv: IED, 2016. 255 p.
16. Poselsky V. The European Union: institutional foundations of European integration. K.: Smoloskip, 2002. 168 p.
17. Law of the European Union: a textbook. / edited by V. I. Muravyov. K.: Yurinkom Inter, 2011. 704 p.
18. Sidoruk T.V. Integration processes in modern Europe: education. help _ Lviv: LA "Pyramid", 2010. 354 p.
19. Todi F., Essay on the history of the European Union. / Trans. from English _ M. Marchenko. K.: K.I.S., 2001. 142 p.
20. Tyushka A. Treaty on the constitution for Europe: genesis, legal nature, political value. K.: K.I.S., 2007. 228 p.
21. Hartly T. K. Fundamentals of European law Communities / T.K. Hartly ; [trans. with English]. M.: Law and Law, UNITY, 1998. –03 c.
22. Yakovyuk I.V. Legal foundations of European integration: general theoretical analysis: monograph. Kh.: Pravo, 2013. 760 p.

Additional literature:

1. Anakina T. M. Institutional model of cooperation between Ukraine and the European Union under the Association Agreement. *Law forum*. 2013. No. 3. P. 14-21.
2. Anakina T. M. Peculiarities of Eastern Partnership policy in the context of European integration of Ukraine. *The European Union and Ukraine:*

peculiarities of mutual relations at the present stage (Series "Scientific reports"; issue 1). Kh.: Oberig, 2012. P. 48-61.

3. Anakina T. Comparative legal characteristics of the Association Agreement and the Partnership and Cooperation Agreement between Ukraine and the European Union. *Visn . National _ Acad. rights of Sciences of Ukraine*. 2013. No. 4 (75). P. 123-132.
4. Anakina T. Regulation of the rights of certain vulnerable groups of persons under the EU Charter on Fundamental Rights: experience for Ukraine. *Ukrainian Journal of International Law*. 2015. No. 2. C. 41-46.
5. Galan V.O. The latest trends in the development of European mediation. European Institute of Peace. *The strategy of carrying out the constitutional reform in the conditions of the integration of Ukraine into the EU* : Collection of sciences. articles and abstracts reported. for mother science and practice conference, Kharkiv, May 20 , 2015. H.: State Research Institute. building and place self-government, 2015. P. 52-56.
6. Golovko -Gavrysheva O. Legal regulation of social policy in the European Union: theoretical aspects: monograph; Lviv. national _ University named after Ivan Franko. L.: Ed. center of LNU named after Ivan Franko, 2008. 220 c.
7. Komarova T.V. Practice of the Court of the European Union regarding the accession of the EU to the Convention on the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms. *Actual problems of modern international law* : coll . Science articles based on the materials of the 1st Kharkiv International Law Readings, dedicated to the memory of Prof. M. V. Yanovskyi and V. S. Semenov, Kharkiv, November 27, 2015; Kh.: Pravo, 2015. P. 135-144.
8. Komarova T. V. Direct effect of association agreements with the European Union: Ukrainian dimension. *The Rome Declaration of the EU: new priorities*

for the development of a united Europe: a collection of scientific articles based on the materials of the scientific and practical conference (Kharkov, May 12, 2017). P. 7-15.

9. Komarova T. V. The Court of the EU and the national interests of the member states of the European Union. *Problems of legality*. 2016. Issue _ 134. P. 190-198.
10. Komarova T.V. The Court of Justice of the European Coal and Steel Community as a prototype of the Court of Justice of the EU. *Problems of legality* 2018. Issue. 140. P.144-153.
11. Komarova T.V. Practice of the EU Court of Justice and constitutionalization of European law. *Rule of law*. 2018. No. 29. P. 123-130.
12. Komarova T. The phenomenon of judicial activism in the practice of the Court of Justice of the European Union. *Law of Ukraine* 2018. No. 2. P. 217-232.
13. Komarova T. V. The problem of protecting the rights of private individuals in the Court of Justice of the European Union. *Law forum*. 2018. No. 1. P. 66–72.
14. Komarova T.V. Legal force of decisions of the Court of Justice of the European Union. *Scientific Bulletin of the Uzhhorod National University*. "Law" series. 2018. No. 49. Volume 2. P. 193-196.
15. Komarova T.V. Peculiarities of interaction of national courts of EU member states with the Court of Justice of the European Union. *Law and society*. 2018. No. 2, part 2. P. 234-238.
16. Komarova T.V. Organization of the judicial system of the European Union. *Bulletin of the National Academy of Legal Sciences of Ukraine*. Volume 25. No. 1, 2018. P. 79-96.
17. Komarova T.V. Formation of the judicial corps in the EU: recent trends. *Problems of legality*. 2018. Issue _ 141. P. 201-213.

18. Komarova T.V. Procedural autonomy of national courts of EU member states in the practice of the Court of Justice of the European Union. *Entrepreneurship, economy and law*. 018. No. 5. P. 280-285.
19. Komarova T.V. The relationship between international law and EU law in the practice of the Court of Justice of the European Union. *Scientific Bulletin of Kherson State University. Series Legal sciences*. 2018. Issue 2. Volume. 2. P. 164-168.
20. Komarova T.V. The EU Court of Justice as a body for the protection of fundamental human rights. *State and law*. 2018. Issue 80. P. 173-188.
21. Komarova T. Interaction of the Court of Justice of the European Union with other judicial institutions. *Law of Ukraine*. 2018. 4. P. 223-232.
22. Komarova T. Practice of the Court of Justice of the European Union regarding the protection of procedural rights of competition subjects in the EU internal market. *Journal of European and Comparative Law*. 2018. 8. P. 23-41.
23. Komarova T. The role of the Court of Justice of the European Union in the formation of the doctrine of constitutionalization of EU law. *Law of Ukraine*. 2019. No. 6. P. 69-85.
24. Damirciev, M.I.; Komarov, V.V.; Komarova, T.V. Protection of Ukrainian Business in the European Union Competition Law. *Financial - credit activity: problems theories and practice* _ Tom . 4, No. 31 (2019). S. _ 105-111.

25. Kulabukhova A. V. The influence of citizens on the functioning of the EU and the problem of the "deficit of democracy". *State construction and local self-government*. Kh.: Pravo, 2015. Issue 29. P. 166–178.
26. Kulabukhova A. V. Evolution of the idea of common European citizenship before the Maastricht Treaty. *Law forum*. 2016. No. 1. P. 128–134.
27. Kulabukhova A. V. Catalog of the rights of citizens of the European Union. *Law and innovation*. 2016. No. 1. P. 270–275.
28. Luts, L. A. European interstate legal systems and problems of integration with them of the legal system of Ukraine (theoretical aspects). K.: Institute of State and Law named after V.M. Koretsky National Academy of Sciences of Ukraine, 2003. 304 p.
29. Mushak N. B. International legal principles of protection and provision of human rights in European international organizations: monograph; under the

- editorship Prof. V. I. Muravyov; National _ Acad. of Sciences of Ukraine, Kyiv. University of Law K.: Lira-K, 2013. –188 p.
30. Mushak N. B. Legal principles of the functioning of the Schengen area: monograph. Odesa: Phoenix, 2017. 442 p.
31. Sarakutsa M. O. Some aspects of realization of political rights of citizens of the European Union. *Law and society*. 2014. No. 1. P. 42–48.
32. Sviatun O. V. Consular protection of EU citizens in third countries. *Visnyk Kyiv. national _ University named after Taras Shevchenko. International _ relations _* 2012. Issue _ 38–39. P. 111–115.
33. Smirnova K. V. Legal regulation of competition in the European Union: theory and practice: monograph; Kyiv. national _ University named after Taras Shevchenko. Odesa: Phoenix, 2015. 429 p.
34. Tragnyuk O. Ya. The influence of the practice of the EU Court on the limitation of the competence of the member states of the European Union regarding the acquisition and loss of EU citizenship. *European integration in the context of modern geopolitics: coll. of science Art. according to the materials of sciences. conference, Kharkiv, May 24 2016. Kharkiv, 2016. P. 52–61.*
35. Trahnyuk O. Ya. Some legal means of overcoming the deficit of democracy in the European Union (on the example of the institute of citizens' initiative in the EU). *State construction and local self-government*. Kh.: Pravo, 2011. Issue 22. P. 86–95.
36. Yakovyuk I. V. EU citizenship: concept and relationship with national citizenship. *Problems of legality*. 2010. Issue _ 107. P. 13–22.
37. A Plea for a Foreigner Affairs Exception. *Legal Issues of Economic Integration*. 2003. Vol. 30, No. 1. R. 61–79.

38. Abenħaim M. Epilogue, at least, he the reform of the General Court. Kluwer Competition Law Blog, January 26, 2016. URL: <http://kluwer-competitionlawblog.com/2016/01/26/epilogue-at-last-on-the-reform-of-the-general-court/> (accessed March 13, 2018).
39. Baranowska G. 'A Tale of Two Borders: Poland's continued illegal actions at its border with Belarus ', (10 March 2022) VerfBlog, <https://verfassungsblog.de/a-tale-of-two-borders/> .
40. Barents R. Remedies and Procedures before the EU Courts. Wolters Kluwer , 2016. 909
41. Blauberger M. _ With Luxembourg in Mind ... The Remaking of National Policies in the Face of ECJ Jurisprudence. *Journal of European Public Policy*. 2012. Vol. 19, Issue 1. P. 109–126.
42. Blauberger M. The European Court of Justice and its political Impact. *West European Politics*. 2017. Vol. 40, No. 4. P. _ 907–918.
43. Cartabia M. Europe as a Space of Constitutional Interdependence: New Questions about the Preliminary Ruling. *German Law Journal*. 2015. Vol. 16, No. 6. R. 1791–1796.
44. Grabowska-Moroz B., Grogan J., Kochenov D.V. Reconciling Theory and Practice of the Rule of Law in the European Union . *Hague J Rule Law*. 2022. 14. P. 101– 1 10.
45. Hegedüs D., Levine D. Hungary monitors not enough that stop first ' rigged ' election in EU (16 February 2022) euobserver <https://euobserver.com/opinion/154355> .
46. Kochenov D. ' The Acquis and Its Principles: The Enforcement of ' Law ' versus the Enforcement of ' Values ' in the European Union ', in A. Jakab and D. Kochenov (eds), *The Enforcement of EU Law and Values* (OUP, 2017), 8.
47. Kochenov DV Elephants in the Room: The European Commission's 2019 Communication he the Rule of Law. *Hague Journal he the Rule of Law* . 2019 . 11 . P. 423-450 . _

48. Kochenov DV Dialogical _ rule of law in the hands of the Court _ of Justice _ _ *CEU DI Working Papers* . _ 2023 . 11 .
https://democracyinstitute.ceu.edu/sites/default/files/article/attachment/2023-04/Dimitry%20Kochenov%20Dialogical%20Rule%20of%20Law%20in%20the%20Hands%20of%20the%20Court%20of%20Justice%20CEU%20DI%20WP%202023_11.pdf
49. Lazowski , A. 2022. Strengthening the rule of law and the EU pre-accession policy : Republic v. Il-Prim Minister _ *Common Market Law Review* . 59 (6), pp . 1803-1822.
50. Lazowski , A. 2022. Court of Justice of the European Union and the United Kingdom after Brexit : Game Over ? *European Law Review* . 47 (6), pp . 666-686.
51. Lazowski , A. and Butler , G. (ed .) 2022. *Shaping EU Law the British Way . UK Advocates General at the Court of Justice of the European Union* . Oxford Hart Publishing . 654 p.
52. Lazowski , A. (ed .) 2010. *The application of EU law in the new member states : brave new world* . Oxford Oxford University Press . 586 p.
53. Makszimov V. Commission that trigger mechanism that could see Hungary lose EU funds (5 April 2022) , Euractiv , <https://www.euractiv.com/section/politics/news/commission-to-trigger-mechanism-that-could-see-hungary-lose-eu-funds/>
54. Pech L. _ Promoting the Rule of Law Abroad in *The European Union's Shaping of the International Legal Order* , eds D Kochenov & F Amtenbrink , Cambridge University Press , Cambridge , 2013 . pp . 108–129.
55. Pech L., Kochenov DV, Respect for the Rule of Law in the Case-Law of the Court of Justice : A Casebook Overview of the Key Judgments since the Portuguese Judges Case . Stockholm : SIEPS, 2021.
56. Peers S. _ The CJEU and the EU's accession that the ECHR: a clear and present danger that human rights protection 2014 Available from : <

<http://eulawanalysis.blogspot.co.uk/2014/12/the-cjeu-and-eus-accession-to-echr.html> >

57. Rasmussen H. *On the Law and Policy in the European Court of Justice*. Dordrecht; Boston; London: Martinus Nijhoff Publishers, 1986. 555 p.
58. Rasmussen H. The European Court's Act Clair Strategy in CILFIT; Or: Acte Clair of Course! But What Does it Mean? *European Law Review* 1984. Vol. 9. R. 242–259.
59. Recommendations that national courts and tribunals in relationship that the initiation of preliminary ruling proceedings (2018/C 257/01). *Court of Justice of the European Union. Official Journal of the European Union*. 2018.
60. Scheppele KL, Kochenov DV, Grabowska-Moroz B. EU Values Are Law, After All : Enforcing EU Values through Systemic Infringement Actions by the European Commission and the Member States of the European Union . *Yearbook of European Law*. 2020. 39. P. 3 -21.
61. Stone Sweet A. The European Court of Justice and the Judicialisation of EU Governance. *Living Reviews in EU Governance*. 2010. Vol. 5, No. 2. 54 p.
62. Valiullina F. Dialogue of the Courts in Europe: Interactions between the European Court of Human Rights, the Court of Justice of the European Union and the Courts of the ECHR Member States. *Doctor's thesis*. 2017.
63. Wagenbaur B. Court of Justice of the EU: Commentary he Statute and Rules of Procedure . CH Beck, Hart, Nomos, 2013. 921
64. Ward A. *Judicial Review and the Rights of Private Parties in EC Law*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000. 700 p.
65. Wennerås P. Saving a forest and the rule of law: Commission v Poland. Case C-441/17 R, Commission v Poland, Order of the Court (Grand Chamber) of 20 November 2017. *CMLRev*. 2019. 56. P. 541 -562.

Internet resources:

Official website of the EU: <http://europa.eu.int>

European Parliament: www.europarl.europa.eu

Council of the EU: www.consilium.europa.eu

European Commission: ec.europa.eu

Court of Justice of the EU: <http://curia.europa.eu/>

European Chamber of Accounts: eca.europa.eu

European Central Bank: www.ecb.int

Economic and Social Committee: www.eesc.europa.eu

Committee of the Regions: www.cor.europa.eu

European Ombudsman: www.ombudsman.europa.eu

agencies : europa.eu/agencies

Europol : www.europol.europa.eu

Database of EU legislation: <http://eur-lex.europa.eu/en/index.htm>

the public to participate in the EU legislative process:
http://ec.europa.eu/yourvoice/consultations/index_en.htm

Animation about the decision-making process in the EU:
<http://europarlament.toutteleurope.eu/understanding/decision-making/print.html>

General reports on EU activities <http://europa.eu/generalreport/en/welcome.htm>

Human rights in EU law (EU information site):
http://europa.eu/pol/rights/index_en.htm

Center for official EU documentation: publications.europa.eu

Catalogs: www.europa.eu.int/libraries

Eurostat : epp.eurostat.ec.europa.eu

European space: <http://eu.prostir.ua/>

EU Historical Archives: <http://www.iue.it/ECArchives/EN/Eurhistar.shtml>

European External Action Service: <http://www.eeas.europa.eu/>

of the EU in Ukraine: http://eeas.europa.eu/delegations/ukraine/index_uk.htm

Association Agreement between Ukraine, on the one hand, and the European Union, the European Atomic Energy Community and their member states, on the other hand, 2014: http://www.kmu.gov.ua/kmu/control/uk/publish/article?art_id=248387631&cat_id=223223535

Implementation of the Association Agreement by Ukraine: <https://pulse.kmu.gov.ua>
acquis acts translated into Ukrainian: <https://minjust.gov.ua/acquis-communautaire>